

Palaeography

DIGITAL HUMANITIES FOR MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHICAL SOURCES

10. Critical apparatus

conf. dr. Mihai MAGA

Babeş-Bolyai University, Cluj-Napoca
Master in Ancient and Medieval Philosophy

2nd semester, 2023–2024
HME2415/10

<https://www.dhcluj.ro/dhm/>

- 1 Critical apparatus components
- 2 General critical observations
- 3 Critical apparatus attached to the text
 - Philological/palaeographical apparatus
 - Sources apparatus
 - Other types of apparatus
- 4 Example

- general elements
 - the critical remarks which concern the whole edited text are discussed in the introduction
- textual elements
 - the critical observations which concern precise parts of text are presented in the critical apparatus of the text (e.g. footnotes)
 - the philological or palaeographical apparatus
 - the textual sources apparatus
 - other types of apparatus

- The editor must specify the information about the text, sources and context in the introduction:
 - datation
 - attribution (author)
 - manuscripts (datation, attribution, physical description, history, *stemma codicum*)
 - text sources and tradition
 - editorial principles
- It is preferable that any repetitive observation in text to be exposed in the introduction, not in the textual apparatus (e.g. an orthography particularity, or a frequent mistakes)
- All the editorial decisions must be specified in the introduction (the orthography of the edition, notation conventions, the system of the textual critical apparatus, etc.)

- Must clearly indicate to which part of the text it refers
 - the lines are usually numbered
 - the footnotes indicate the lemma
 - the column breaks are marked in the text and in margin
- Must clearly and briefly expose the observation
 - the manuscripts are abbreviated by sigils
 - the editor's observations contain conventional abbreviations
 - the position in the apparatus implicitly indicates the type of observation
- The editor's critical decisions must be clearly highlighted
 - the corrected words are marked in footnotes: *coni.*, *emend.*
 - the words added by the editor are marked with specific signs: <...>

- Contains the description of the textual variations and of the particularities of each witness of the text
- Often, when there are many source manuscripts, certain types of observations are discarded (e.g. mistakes corrected in the ms., redundant marginals) and the groups of manuscripts which frequently have the same reading are represented by a single sigil (in extreme cases, only group readings are rendered)
- The details of the palaeographical apparatus have been discussed in *Course 9*.

- The medieval texts contain quotes, references and implicit assumptions from previous texts
- The critical editions indicate in the apparatus the textual sources using modern editions (if available) and current standards for citation
 - Often, the references are abbreviated in the apparatus and a bibliography with full details of the source texts is added to the edition
- Sometimes the sources apparatus is divided in multiple sets of notes: explicit sources, implicit sources, biblical sources etc.
 - the explicit sources are those announced by the author in the text
- the implicit sources are identifiable takeovers from other texts, but without any indication (it is the role of the editor to find them)
- The indication of the referred words for citation is done through lemmas, like in the philological apparatus



EX: omnes — desiderant] ARIST. *Metaph.* I, 1, 980a21 (A.L. 25.3.2, p. 11, l. 3)

- The witness apparatus (*Traditio textus*)
 - When there are many witnesses which fragmentary transmit the text, the presence or the absence of the edited text in them may be indicated in a separate apparatus
- The comparative apparatus
 - When the text survives in several versions (e.g. several recensions), one of them is edited as main text, and the differences of the others are indicated in a distinct apparatus
- The explanatory apparatus
 - Sometimes the editors add commentaries, explanations and remarks to the text in a distinct set of footnotes or endnotes

(CXLI)

- Isti sunt dies quos obseruare debetis, quia uestri ad reddendam rationem de eis, quia sicut dicit auctoritas: sicut capillus de capite, ita momentum de tempore non peribit. Item, quia mali, ut caueamus ab eis. Item obseruanda sunt quia apti ad seminandum.
- 5 Item quia solutionis debitorum faciente et reformande pacis et impetrande gratie iudicis et assessorum, id est sanctorum et huiusmodi. Dies uero presentes dominice passionis obseruandi sunt, id est cauendum est in eis a fermento, quia sunt dies azimorum. Fermentum tria habet: acedinem scilicet, uacuitatem et tumiditatem. Que tria tres partes mundi quem Iohannes describit significant: *omne quod est in mundo aut est concupiscentia carnis*, etc. Aceditas que facit omnia desipere post se ad luxuriam pertinet, que facit castitatem et huiusmodi desipere, secundum illud: gustata carne desipit spiritus, sicut e contrario. Vacuitas uero ad
- 15 auariciam pertinet, que numquam impleri potest quia *sanguissuge due sunt filie* que semper clamant *affer, affer*. Et dic causas quare non implentur, iuxta (illud): *auarus non implebitur pecunia*, et huiusmodi. Item foraminosi sunt auari sicut fermentum et oriuntur in eis foramina, quia quando habent quod optabant, iterum
- 20 optant aliud. Tales sunt sicut morbus qui uocatur fistula foraminosi. Et aptari potest hoc clericis prebendis et usurariis et huiusmodi. Tumiditas autem ad superbiam et eius species pertinet.

CXLI, 11 Ioh. 2, 16 || 16 Prou. 30, 15 || 17 Eccle. 5, 9

CXLI, 1 [Isti – debetis] *Respons. in dom. in Pass.* (HESBERT IV, n° 7013) || 2/3 sicut – peribit] BERNARD., *Serm. de diu.* 1, 8 (p. 79) || 14 gustata – spiritus] cfr BERNARD., *Epist.* 111, 3 (p. 285)

Trad. text.: *P_e* f. 58va

CXLI, 1 Dominica ante Ramos Palmarum. G. episcopus parisiensis *rubr.* || 12 desipere] decipere *a.c.* || 16 affer, affer] *scripsi*, aufer, aufer || 17 illud] *suppl. om.* || 20/21 foraminosi] foraminosi *a.c.*

End of the course